

THE HONORABLE JAMES L. ROBART

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON  
AT SEATTLE

LEONARDO, S.P.A., an Italian company,

Plaintiff,

v.

THE BOEING COMPANY, a Delaware  
corporation,

Defendant.

No. 2:19-cv-2082

**STIPULATED MOTION AND  
AGREEMENT REGARDING  
DISCOVERY OF ELECTRONICALLY  
STORED INFORMATION AND ORDER**

**NOTED ON MOTIONS CALENDAR:  
August 12, 2020**

Plaintiff Leonardo, S.p.A (“Leonardo”) and Defendant The Boeing Company (“Boeing”) (collectively, the “parties”) hereby stipulate to the following provisions regarding the discovery of electronically stored information (“ESI”) in this matter. The parties are entering into this agreement in an effort to reduce the time, expense, and other burdens associated with the discovery of ESI and privileged material, and to clarify the scope of the parties’ obligations to preserve and produce such information.

**A. Definitions**

1. “Document” or “documents” is defined to be synonymous in meaning and equal in scope to the usage of this term in the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.

1           2.       “Email” means electronic messages sent or received asynchronously via  
2           messaging applications, including, but not limited to, Microsoft Outlook or Google Gmail,  
3           including any documents incorporated as attachments.

4           3.       “Embedded objects” means files contained within other files. A common example  
5           is an Excel file with underlying data and numbers embedded as a visual chart in a PowerPoint or  
6           Word file. Extracting embedded objects means that the Excel file is extracted from the PowerPoint  
7           or Word file and loaded as a separate record. The Excel file in this example would be considered  
8           a “child” of the PowerPoint or Word file. Inline images are considered embedded objects for  
9           purposes of this definition. Email attachments are not considered embedded objects for purposes  
10          of this definition.

11          4.       “ESI” is an abbreviation of “electronically stored information” and shall have  
12          the same meaning and scope as set forth in the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.

13          5.       “Extracted Text” means the text extracted from a native format file and includes  
14          at least all header, footer, and document body information.

15          6.       “Load File” means an electronic file that is used to import all required production  
16          information into a document database, including document images, extracted and/or OCR text,  
17          native files where required, and metadata, as well as information indicating document and page  
18          breaks, and document relationships such as those between an email and its attachments and a  
19          document and information related to embedded content.

20          7.       “Metadata” means structured information about ESI that is created by the file  
21          system or application, embedded in the document or email and sometimes modified through  
22          ordinary business use. Metadata of the ESI describes the characteristics, origins, and usage of the  
23          collected ESI.

1           8.       “Native Format” means the format of ESI in the application in which the ESI was  
2 originally created.

3           9.       “OCR” means the optical character recognition technology used to read paper  
4 documents or electronic images of documents and output such documents to a searchable text  
5 format. The latter text is also referred to as the “OCR text” or simply “OCR.”

6           10.      “Tagged Image File Format” or “TIFF” refers to the CCITT Group IV graphic file  
7 format for storing bit-mapped images of ESI or paper documents.

## 8 **B.     General Principles**

9           1.       An attorney’s zealous representation of a client is not compromised by conducting  
10 discovery in a cooperative manner. The failure of counsel or the parties to litigation to cooperate  
11 in facilitating and reasonably limiting discovery requests and responses raises litigation costs and  
12 contributes to the risk of sanctions.

13           2.       As provided in LCR 26(f), the proportionality standard set forth in Fed. R. Civ. P.  
14 26(b)(1) must be applied in each case when formulating a discovery plan. To further the  
15 application of the proportionality standard in discovery, requests for production of ESI and related  
16 responses should be reasonably targeted, clear, and as specific as possible.

17 **C.     ESI Disclosures** Within 30 days of entry of this Order, or at a later time if agreed by the  
18 parties, each party shall disclose:

19           1.       Custodians and Organization Charts. The fifteen custodians most likely to have  
20 discoverable ESI in their possession, custody, or control. The custodians shall be identified by  
21 name, title, connection to the instant litigation, and the type of the information under the  
22 custodian’s control. To the extent such documents exist and are reasonably available, the parties  
23  
24  
25  
26

1 also agree to provide relevant organizational charts (or similar documents) that will assist the  
2 other party in identifying the proposed custodian's current position within the company.

3 2. Non-Custodial Data Sources. A list of non-custodial data sources (*e.g.*, shared  
4 drives, servers), if any, likely to contain discoverable ESI. This disclosure shall include, without  
5 limitation, any hard copy data sources.  
6

7 3. Third-Party Data Sources. A list of third-party data sources, if any, likely to  
8 contain discoverable ESI (*e.g.*, third-party email providers, cloud storage) and, for each such  
9 source, the extent to which a party is (or is not) able to preserve information stored in the third-  
10 party data source.

11 4. Inaccessible Data. A list of data sources, if any, likely to contain discoverable ESI  
12 (by type, date, custodian, electronic system or other criteria sufficient to specifically identify the  
13 data source) that a party asserts is not reasonably accessible under Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(b)(2)(B).  
14

15 5. Foreign Data Privacy Laws. Nothing in this Order is intended to prevent either  
16 party from complying with the requirements of a foreign country's data privacy laws, *e.g.*, the  
17 European Union's General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) (EU) 2016/679. If the producing  
18 party identifies a particular discovery request that the producing party claims would call for  
19 production of documents in violation of a foreign data privacy law, the parties agree to meet and  
20 confer to address any such objection.  
21

#### 22 **D. ESI Discovery Procedures**

23 1. On-site inspection of electronic media. Such an inspection shall not be required  
24 absent a demonstration by the requesting party of specific need and good cause or agreement by  
25 the parties.  
26

1           2.     Search Methodology. The parties shall timely confer to attempt to reach  
2 agreement on appropriate search terms and queries, file type and date restrictions, data sources  
3 (including custodians), and other appropriate computer- or technology-aided methodologies,  
4 before any such effort is undertaken. The parties shall continue to cooperate in revising the  
5 appropriateness of the search methodology.  
6

7           a.     Prior to running searches:

8                   i.     The producing party shall disclose the data sources (including  
9 custodians), search terms and queries, any file type and date restrictions, and any other  
10 methodology that it proposes to use to locate ESI likely to contain responsive and discoverable  
11 information. The producing party may provide unique hit counts for each search query.  
12

13                   ii.    The requesting party is entitled to, within 14 days of the producing  
14 party's disclosure, add no more than 15 search terms or queries to those disclosed by the  
15 producing party absent a showing of good cause or agreement of the parties.

16                   iii.   The following provisions apply to search terms / queries of the  
17 requesting party. Focused terms and queries should be employed; broad terms or queries, such  
18 as product and company names, generally should be avoided. A conjunctive combination of  
19 multiple words or phrases (*e.g.*, "computer" and "system") narrows the search and shall count as  
20 a single search term. A disjunctive combination of multiple words or phrases (*e.g.*, "computer"  
21 or "system") broadens the search, and thus each or phrase shall count as a separate search term  
22 unless they are variants of the same word. In response, the producing party may identify each  
23 search term or query returning overbroad results demonstrating the overbroad results and a  
24 counter proposal correcting the overbroad search or query. A search that returns more than 1,000  
25 unique documents, excluding families, is presumed to be overbroad.  
26

1           b.       After production: Within 21 days of the producing party notifying the  
2 receiving party that it has substantially completed the production of documents responsive to a  
3 request, the responding party may request no more than 10 additional search terms or queries.  
4 The immediately preceding section (Section D(2)(a)(iii)) applies.  
5

6 **E.       Negotiation of Search Protocol**

7           1.       The parties agree, subject to the principle of proportionality and the parties' shared  
8 goal of efficiency, to consider additional custodians, central repositories, or search terms in good  
9 faith as discovery proceeds to the extent that fact discovery reveals that the additional custodians,  
10 central repositories, or search terms are likely to return substantial non-duplicative responsive  
11 materials.  
12

13           2.       In addition, the parties agree that, as additional sets of Rule 34 document requests  
14 are issued, the parties will meet and confer to determine whether additional custodians, central  
15 repositories, or search terms may be warranted.

16 **F.       Miscellaneous Provisions**

17           1.       The parties agree to negotiate any discovery-related dispute in good faith and  
18 attempt to resolve any such dispute without involving the Court.

19           2.       Nothing in this Order shall preclude the producing party from collecting or  
20 producing additional materials beyond those identified pursuant to the procedure described  
21 above.  
22

23           3.       Upon reasonable request, a party shall disclose information relating to network  
24 design, the types of databases, organizational chart for information systems personnel, and  
25 destruction/overwrite policy.  
26

1           4.       No inspection of electronic media shall be required absent a demonstration by  
2 the requesting party of specific need in light of the proportionality standards set forth in Fed. R.  
3 Civ. P. 26(b) and good cause or by agreement of the parties.

4           5.       The parties may use reasonable techniques to further identify relevant or irrelevant  
5 documents, including, but not limited to, predictive coding and other technology-assisted review.  
6 The producing party will respond to reasonable requests for information from the requesting party  
7 regarding the producing party's use of such tools.  
8

9       **G.       Format for Production of ESI**

10           1.       General Format Requirements. The parties will produce ESI in accordance with  
11 the following general format requirements.

12               a.       ESI will be produced to the requesting party with searchable text, in the  
13 format set forth herein and as otherwise agreed. Acceptable formats include, but are not limited  
14 to, native files, multi-page TIFFs (with a companion OCR or extracted text file), single-page  
15 TIFFs (only with load files for e-discovery software that includes metadata fields identifying  
16 natural document breaks and also includes companion OCR and/or extracted text files), and  
17 searchable PDF.  
18

19               b.       Single-page Group IV TIFFs should be provided, at least 300 dots per inch  
20 (dpi). Single-page TIFF images should be named according to the unique bates number, followed  
21 by the extension ".TIF". Original document orientation should be maintained (i.e., portrait to  
22 portrait and landscape to landscape). Documents containing color need not be produced in color,  
23 except that (i) word processing documents that contain hidden text or comments shall be produced  
24 in color in JPG or PNG format. The producing party will honor reasonable requests to provide  
25 color image of a document.  
26

1 c. For each document originating in electronic format, a text file containing  
2 the full text of each document should be provided along with the image files and metadata. Text  
3 of native files should be extracted directly from the native file. The text file should be named  
4 according to the unique bates number, followed by the extension “.TXT.” The parties agree that  
5 the full text and/or OCR of any document will not be contained within a database load file, but  
6 rather as a standalone file with each text file containing an entire document as they are defined.  
7

8 d. An image load file (.OPT, .LFP) will be produced that can be loaded into  
9 commercially acceptable production software (e.g., Opticon, iPro). Each image in a production  
10 must be referenced in the corresponding image load file. An exemplar load file format is below.  
11

12 ABC0000001,PROD001,\\IMAGES\001\ABC0000001.tif,Y,,2

13 ABC0000002,PROD001,\\IMAGES\001\ABC0000002.tif,,,

14 ABC0000003,PROD001,\\IMAGES\001\ABC0000003.tif,Y,,1

15 e. Unless otherwise agreed to by the parties, files that are not easily converted  
16 to image format, such as spreadsheets, computer slide presentations, audio files, video files,  
17 databases, structured data files, and drawing files, will be produced in native format. In addition,  
18 a party may request that, for good cause, a specific file be produced in native format, and the  
19 producing party will endeavor to accommodate any such requests. The Parties agree that when  
20 producing a native file, they will include a TIFF image as a placeholder for the file to represent  
21 the file in the production set. The TIFF image placeholder for a native file should be branded with  
22 a unique Bates number and state “Document Produced in Native Format” on the TIFF image. The  
23 native file should then be renamed to match the Bates number assigned to the document, along  
24 with its original file extension. The filename field produced in the production load file that reflects  
25 the original metadata should maintain the original file name.  
26



1           f.       Each document image file shall be named with a unique Bates number.  
2       Bates number file names should not be more than twenty characters long or contain spaces. When  
3       a text-searchable image file is produced, the producing party must preserve the integrity of the  
4       underlying ESI, *i.e.*, the original formatting, the metadata (as noted below) and, where applicable,  
5       the revision history, to the extent reasonably practical.  
6

7           g.       If a document is more than one page, the unitization of the document and  
8       any attachments and/or affixed notes shall be maintained as they existed in the original document.

9           h.       Parent-child relationships (the association between an attachment and its  
10      parent document) must be preserved in such a way that a document and any attachments to that  
11      document are produced in the same production set and the relationships are identifiable. The  
12      parties agree to provide beginning attachment and ending attachment fields in the database load  
13      file to capture the entire production number range for the parent/child(ren) documents.  
14

15          i.       Embedded objects shall not be treated as separate files. A party may  
16      request that documents that contain embedded files be produced as separate files. The requesting  
17      party shall provide a list of the BEGBATES values of documents from which they request  
18      embedded files. Upon receipt, the producing party shall within a reasonable time to provide the  
19      embedded files in production format as required by the governing provisions of this Order. Email  
20      attachments are not considered embedded objects but are treated as separate documents under this  
21      Order.  
22

23          j.       Before any party produces electronic data that is not easily converted to  
24      static TIFF images, such as databases, CAD drawings, GIS data, websites, social media, etc., the  
25      parties will meet and confer to discuss the appropriate format for the production of said  
26      documents.

1           k.       When a document requires redaction, the parties agree that native files, full  
2 text and/or OCR, and specified metadata fields will be excluded. Metadata fields for exclusion in  
3 redacted documents include SUBJECT and FILE\_NAME. The TIFF image should show the  
4 caption [Redacted-Privileged, etc.] where applicable and a production load file field should be  
5 populated to indicate the document contains a redaction.  
6

7           l.       The parties will process all ESI for production using the Pacific Standard  
8 Time Zone.

9           2.       De-duplication. To the extent reasonably practicable, the parties shall produce  
10 only a single copy of a responsive document and may de-duplicate their ESI production (based  
11 on MD5 or SHA-1 hash values at the document level) across custodial and non-custodial data  
12 sources after disclosure to the requesting party. Duplicate custodian information removed during  
13 the de-duplication process shall be tracked in a duplicate/other custodian field in the database  
14 load file. For emails with attachments, the hash value is generated based on the parent/child  
15 document grouping. However, metadata identifying all custodians in possession of each  
16 document that is removed as a duplicate must be produced in an "CUSTODIANS\_ALL" field in  
17 the production load file. To accommodate rolling productions, for ESI that is removed as duplicate  
18 ESI from earlier productions, the producing party will provide the requesting party with an  
19 overlay file no later than five (5) days after the date of each rolling production and will include  
20 an updated "CUSTODIANS\_ALL" metadata information, which will be updated with the  
21 duplicate custodians' names. Attachment(s) should not be eliminated as duplicates for purposes  
22 of production, unless the parent e-mail and all attachments are also duplicates.  
23  
24

25           3.       Email Threading. The parties may use analytics technology to identify email  
26 threads and should, to the extent reasonably practicable, only produce the unique most inclusive

1 copy and related family members and may exclude lesser inclusive copies. Email threading shall  
 2 not exclude from production shorter versions of an email exchange that include attachments,  
 3 email exchanges that branch off into separate threads/conversations, or emails in which a user  
 4 changes the text of a prior email. Upon reasonable request, the producing party will produce a  
 5 less inclusive version.  
 6

7 4. Metadata fields. The parties agree that the following metadata fields will be  
 8 produced (in the order listed below), to the extent such data is reasonably accessible and non-  
 9 privileged.<sup>1</sup>

- 10 • BEGBATES: Beginning Bates number as stamped on the production image;
- 11 • ENDBATES: Ending Bates number as stamped on the production image;
- 12 • BEGATTACH: First production Bates number of the first document in a family;
- 13 • ENDATTACH: Last production Bates number of the last document in a family;
- 14 • CUSTODIAN: Custodian from whom document originated, or storage location if
- 15 no custodian;
- 16 • CUSTODIANS\_ALL<sup>2</sup>: Custodian(s) that had electronic files that were removed
- 17 due to de-duplication;
- 18 • AUTHOR: Any value populated in the Author field of the document properties;
- 19 • LAST\_AUTHOR: The last author to have modified the document;
- 20 • FROM: The name and email address of the sender of an email;
- 21 • TO: All recipients that were included on the “To” line of an email;
- 22
- 23
- 24

25 <sup>1</sup> All dates shall be in the following format: MM/DD/YYYY

26 <sup>2</sup> The CUSTODIANS\_ALL field should be populated by the party to identify other custodians in possession of the document before deduplication is applied to the data set.

- CC: All recipients that were included in the “CC” line of an email;
- BCC: All recipients that were included in the “BCC” line of an email;
- SUBJECT<sup>3</sup>: The subject line of an email;
- FILE\_NAME<sup>4</sup>: File name of an electronic documents, including loose files and attachments to email;
- FILE\_SIZE: Size of document;
- FILE\_EXTENSION: Characters of file name indicating the relevant program used to open the file;
- ORIGINAL\_FILEPATH: Original location of file;
- DATE\_CREATED: Original date document created;
- TIME\_CREATED: Original time file created;
- DATE\_SENT: Date email was sent;
- TIME\_SENT: Time email was sent;
- PARENT\_DATE: The date of the parent email applied to the parent email and all attachments;
- DATE\_RECEIVED: Date email was received;
- TIME\_RECEIVED: Time email was received;
- DATE\_MODIFIED: Date an electronic document was last modified;
- HASH\_VALUE: The MD5 or SHA-1 hash value;

<sup>3</sup> The parties agree that the SUBJECT field is not required to be produced if the document requires redaction.

<sup>4</sup> The parties agree that the FILE\_NAME field is not required to be produced if the document requires redaction.

- DOC\_TYPE: Description of document (email, attachment, electronic document, hard copy, etc.);
- NATIVE\_LINK: The native file link for agreed upon native files, if applicable (e.g., for Excel files);
- REDACTED: Populate “Yes” if a document contains a redaction;
- CONFIDENTIALITY: Populate “Yes” if a document is designated as Confidential Material;
- AEO: Populate “Yes” if a document is designated as containing Attorneys’ Eyes Only (AEO) Material;
- EXPORT\_CONTROLLED: Populate “Yes” if a document is designated as containing Export-Controlled Material;
- PRODUCTION\_VOLUME: Identification of production media or volume name of each individual production deliverable.

The parties are not obligated to manually populate any of the foregoing fields if such fields cannot be extracted from a document, with the exception of fields that require population in the first instance (e.g., BEGBATES). The foregoing list of metadata types is intended to be flexible and may be changed by agreement of the parties, particularly in light of advances and changes in technology, vendor, and business practices.

5. Metadata Load File. Each production shall be accompanied by a Concordance or ASCII delimited load file (.DAT) that can be loaded into commercially acceptable database software (e.g., Relativity). The first line of each text file must contain a header identifying each

1 data field name (i.e., header row). Each document within the database load file must contain the  
2 same number of fields as defined in the header row.

3         6.     Hard-Copy Documents. All hard copy documents will be scanned and produced  
4 in electronic format. Each party's production of hard-copy documents will include a cross-  
5 reference file that indicates document breaks and sets forth the custodian or custodian/location  
6 associated with each produced document. Hard-copy documents will be converted into single-  
7 page TIFF images and produced following the same protocol set forth herein or as otherwise  
8 agreed, unless the producing party can show that the cost would outweigh the usefulness of  
9 scanning (for example, when the condition of the paper is not conducive to scanning and will not  
10 result in accurate or reasonably useable/searchable ESI). Images of all file labels, file headings,  
11 and file folders associated with any hard copy document will be produced with the images of the  
12 hard copy documents. Each file will be named with a unique Bates Number (*e.g.*, the unique Bates  
13 Number of the first page of the corresponding production version of the document followed by  
14 its file extension). The database load file shall include the following fields: BEGBATES,  
15 ENDBATES, BEGATTACH, ENDATTACH, CUSTODIAN, CONFIDENTIALITY, AEO,  
16 EXPORT\_CONTROLLED, REDACTED, OCR\_TEXT, and PRODUCTION\_VOLUME.

17  
18  
19         7.     Specific File Types. The following production standards apply to specific file  
20 types:

- 21         • MS Office files, WordPerfect, other standard documents, such as PDF documents  
22 and the like, will be converted to single-page TIFF images and produced consistent  
23 with the specifications herein. If the document contains comments or tracked  
24 changes, the TIFF images shall be generated to include the comments or track  
25 changes contained in the file.  
26

- Email and attachments should be converted to single-page TIFF images and produced consistent with the specifications provided herein. Attachments shall be processed as separate documents, and the text database load file shall include a field in which the producing party shall identify the production range of all attachments of each e-mail.
- The parties shall process presentations (MS PowerPoint, Google Presently, Google Docs) in native format.
- The parties shall produce spreadsheets (e.g. MS Excel, Google Trix, Google Sheets) in native format, where available and not redacted. TIFF images of spreadsheets need not be produced unless a spreadsheet is redacted. If a spreadsheet requires redaction, then TIFF images of the spreadsheet after the redaction has been applied will be produced and the native file and full text will be withheld. Alternatively, spreadsheets with redactions may be supplied in native format with redactions applied and redacted text removed.
- Digital photographs will be produced as image files.

8. Production Media. Documents and ESI shall be produced on optical media (CD or DVD), external hard drives, or via an FTP site, or similar, readily accessible electronic media (the “Production Media”). Each piece of Production Media shall identify a production number corresponding to the party and production with which the documents on the Production Media are associated (e.g., “[Defendant Party] 001”, “[Plaintiff Party] 001”), as well as the volume of the material in that production (e.g., “-001”, “-002”). For example, if the first production from a party comprises document images on three hard drives, the party shall label each hard drive in the

1 following manner: “[Party Name] 001-001”, “[Party Name] 001-002”, and “[Party Name] 001  
 2 003.” Each piece of Production Media shall be labeled to also identify: (1) the production date;  
 3 and (2) the production number range of the materials contained on the Production Media.

4  
 5 9. Encryption. Industry-standard encryption tools and practices must be used when  
 6 transferring data between parties. Passwords must be at least 8 characters with a mix of character  
 7 sets and sent in a separate communication from the encrypted data.

8 10. No Identification of Responsive RFPs. The parties agree that the producing party  
 9 is under no obligation to identify the request for production to which a particular document is  
 10 responsive to, nor is the producing party obligated to identify (by Bates numbers or otherwise)  
 11 which documents are being produced in response to a particular request for production. Rather,  
 12 the parties recognize and agree that each party will produce sizeable document productions  
 13 pursuant to the procedures of Sections C-H of this Order and otherwise that are not segregated or  
 14 categorized by request for production, but rather are produced in response to the requesting  
 15 party’s document requests as a whole.  
 16

#### 17 **H. Preservation of ESI**

18 The parties acknowledge that they have a common law obligation, as expressed in Fed. R.  
 19 Civ. P. 37(e), to take reasonable and proportional steps to preserve discoverable information in  
 20 the party’s possession, custody, or control. With respect to preservation of ESI, the parties agree  
 21 as follows:  
 22

23 1. Absent a showing of good cause by the requesting party, the parties shall not be  
 24 required to modify the procedures used by them in the ordinary course of business to back-up and  
 25 archive data; provided, however, that the parties shall preserve all discoverable ESI in their  
 26



1 possession, custody, or control in accordance with the requirements of the Federal Rules of Civil  
2 Procedure.

3           2.       The parties will supplement their disclosures in accordance with Fed. R. Civ. P.  
4 26(e) with discoverable ESI where that data is created after a disclosure or response is made.

5           3.       Absent a showing of good cause by the requesting party, the following categories  
6 of ESI need not be preserved:

- 7
- 8           a. Deleted, slack, fragmented, or other data (including “unallocated” space  
9 on hard drives) only accessible by forensics.
  - 10          b. Data duplicated in any electronic backup system for the purpose of  
11 system recovery or information restoration, including, but not limited to,  
12 system recovery backup tapes, continuity of operations systems, and data  
13 or system mirrors or shadows, if such data are routinely purged,  
overwritten, or otherwise made not reasonably accessible in accordance  
with an established routine system maintenance policy.
  - 14          c. Random access memory (RAM), temporary files, or other ephemeral data  
that are difficult to preserve without disabling the operating system.
  - 15          d. On-line access data such as temporary internet files, history, cache,  
16 cookies, and the like.
  - 17          e. Data in metadata fields that are frequently updated automatically, such as  
18 last-opened dates.
  - 19          f. Back-up data that are duplicative of data that are more accessible  
elsewhere.
  - 20          g. Server, system or network logs.
  - 21          h. Data remaining from systems no longer in use that is unintelligible on the  
22 systems in use.
  - 23          i. Electronic data (*e.g.*, email, calendars, contact data, and notes) stored on  
24 or sent to or from mobile devices (*e.g.*, iPhone, iPad, Android devices).
  - 25          j. Other electronic instant messages (*e.g.*, Skype, WhatsApp).
  - 26          k. Voicemail messages.

1. Telephone recordings.
- m. Logs of calls.
- n. Data stored on photocopiers, printers, scanners, and fax machines;
- o. Any other file types subsequently agreed to by the parties.

Unless otherwise agreed to or ordered by the Court, the parties are not required to obtain a forensic image of preserved data if the native files and associated metadata are preserved as set forth in this Order.

#### **I. Privilege and Work Product<sup>5</sup>**

1. A producing party shall create a privilege log of all documents withheld from production (in whole or in part) on the basis of a privilege or protection, unless otherwise agreed or excepted by this Order. Privilege logs shall include a unique identification number for each document and the basis for the claim (attorney-client privileged or work-product protection). For ESI, the privilege log may be generated using available metadata, and shall include at least the following fields: bates range; author/recipient and to/from/cc/bcc names; the subject matter and title; date created. Should the available metadata provide insufficient information for the purpose of evaluating the privilege claim asserted, the producing party shall include such additional information as required by the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. Privilege logs will be produced to all other parties no later than 60 days prior to the close of discovery, unless an earlier deadline is agreed to by the parties.

2. Redacted documents will be logged and designated as such on the privilege log only upon the reasonable request of the non-producing party in the event the basis for redaction

---

<sup>5</sup> As used herein, the term “privilege” encompasses both the attorney-client privilege as well as the work product doctrine and any other applicable privilege.

1 is not evident from the face of the redacted document. Individual redactions need not be  
2 individually logged.

3         3. With respect to privileged or work-product information and/or communications  
4 with outside counsel generated after the filing of the complaint, the parties are not required to  
5 include any such information in privilege logs.  
6

7         4. Activities undertaken in compliance with the duty to preserve information are  
8 protected from disclosure and discovery under Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(b)(3)(A) and (B).

9         5. Pursuant to Fed. R. Evid. 502(d), the production of any documents in this  
10 proceeding shall not, for the purposes of this proceeding or any other federal or state proceeding,  
11 constitute a waiver by the producing party of any privilege applicable to those documents,  
12 including the attorney-client privilege, attorney work-product protection, or any other privilege  
13 or protection recognized by law. Information produced in discovery that is protected as privileged  
14 or work product shall be immediately returned to the producing party or destroyed as provided in  
15 Section J (Clawback Procedures), and its production shall not constitute a waiver of such  
16 protection.  
17

18         6. Testifying experts shall not be subject to discovery on any draft of their reports in  
19 this action and such draft reports, notes, or outlines for draft reports are also exempt from  
20 production and discovery pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(b)(4)(C) and (D). Materials,  
21 communications, and other information exempt from discovery under this paragraph shall be  
22 treated as attorney work product for the purposes of this action.  
23

## 24 **J. Clawback Procedures**

25         1. Should the requesting party identify a document in its possession that was  
26 produced in discovery in this action that appears on its face to be privileged, the requesting party

1 will provide prompt notice to the producing party of the possible inadvertent production of  
2 privileged material and identify the document(s) in question by Bates number.

3           2.       Upon learning (either independently or upon notice by the requesting party) that a  
4 document produced in discovery in this action should have been withheld on privilege grounds  
5 (an “Inadvertently-Produced Document”), the producing party may seek the return and/or  
6 destruction of any such document.  
7

8           3.       The producing party must request the return or destruction of any Inadvertently-  
9 Produced Document(s) promptly after discovering the inadvertent production. To do so, the  
10 producing party must issue a written clawback notice that identifies the document by Bates  
11 number and states the basis for withholding it from production. Within five (5) business days of  
12 when the producing party issues a clawback notice, the requesting party must return or destroy  
13 all copies of the document and certify in writing that it has done so. Electronic copies of the  
14 Inadvertently-Produced Document shall be removed from any electronic system or database of  
15 the requesting party, including sent and received email.  
16

17           4.       If the Inadvertently-Produced Document requires redaction only, the producing  
18 party shall provide to the requesting party a redacted version of the document by submitting a  
19 replacement production containing the original production with the redacted documents included.  
20

21           5.       The producing party will thereafter include the Inadvertently Produced Document  
22 on its privilege log (as amended, if necessary).

23           6.       The return of an Inadvertently-Produced Document does not preclude the  
24 requesting party from challenging the designation of the document on grounds other than waiver  
25 by inadvertent production. To present a challenge to a privilege designation (if needed), the  
26 requesting party will be entitled to rely exclusively upon the producing party’s privilege log and

1 shall not be entitled to retain any copy of the Inadvertently-Produced Document for the purpose  
2 of such challenge.

3 **K. Miscellaneous Provisions**

4  
5 1. By preserving ESI for this litigation, the parties do not waive any objections to the  
6 discoverability, confidentiality, or privileged nature of any documents, including, without  
7 limitation, objections as to the proportionality of the discovery sought.

8 2. Unless otherwise agreed or ordered by the Court, each party shall bear the costs of  
9 preserving, collective, processing, reviewing, and producing its own documents and ESI.

10 3. The parties anticipate that amendments to this Order may be necessary to address  
11 developments in discovery and in the litigation. The parties commit to negotiating any  
12 amendments to this Order in good faith.

13  
14 4. Nothing in this Order shall affect either party's obligations to preserve documents  
15 or information for other purposes, including pursuant to court order, administrative order, statute,  
16 or in regard to other pending or anticipated litigation.

17 5. Nothing in this Order shall eliminate or alter either party's obligation to retain  
18 native format copies, including associated metadata, of all documents produced in this litigation,  
19 together with original hard copy documents for all paper discovery produced in the litigation.  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26

1 DATED: August 12, 2020

2  
3 s/ Jessica M. Andrade

4 Jessica M. Andrade, WSBA No. 39297  
5 Jessica.andrade@polsinelli.com  
6 **Polsinelli P.C.**  
7 1000 Second Avenue, Suite 3500  
8 Seattle, WA 98104  
9 Telephone: 206.393.5400

10 Alan A. D'Ambrosio, *pro hac vice*  
11 adambrosio@dunnington.com

12 William F. Dahill, *pro hac vice*  
13 wdahill@dunnington.com

14 Joseph Johnson  
15 jjohnson@dunnington.com

16 Kamanta C. Kettle  
17 kkettle@dunnington.com

18 **Dunnington, Bartholow & Miller LLP**

19 230 Park Avenue, 21st Floor  
20 New York, NY 10169  
21 Telephone: 212.682.8811

22 *Attorneys for Plaintiff Leonardo S.p.A.*

23 s/ Steve Y. Koh

24 Steve Y. Koh, WSBA No. 23284

25 SKoh@perkinscoie.com

26 Brendan J. Peters, WSBA No. 34490

BPeters@perkinscoie.com

Michael E. Scoville, WSBA No. 44913

MScoville@perkinscoie.com

Mica D. Klein, WSBA No. 46596

MicaKlein@perkinscoie.com

**Perkins Coie LLP**

1201 Third Avenue, Suite 4900

Seattle, WA 98101-3099

Telephone: 206.359.8000

Facsimile: 206.359.9000

*Attorneys for Defendant The Boeing Company*

27  
28 **ORDER**

29 Based on the foregoing, IT IS SO ORDERED.

30 DATED: August 13, 2020

31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65  
66  
67  
68  
69  
70  
71  
72  
73  
74  
75  
76  
77  
78  
79  
80  
81  
82  
83  
84  
85  
86  
87  
88  
89  
90  
91  
92  
93  
94  
95  
96  
97  
98  
99  
100  
101  
102  
103  
104  
105  
106  
107  
108  
109  
110  
111  
112  
113  
114  
115  
116  
117  
118  
119  
120  
121  
122  
123  
124  
125  
126  
127  
128  
129  
130  
131  
132  
133  
134  
135  
136  
137  
138  
139  
140  
141  
142  
143  
144  
145  
146  
147  
148  
149  
150  
151  
152  
153  
154  
155  
156  
157  
158  
159  
160  
161  
162  
163  
164  
165  
166  
167  
168  
169  
170  
171  
172  
173  
174  
175  
176  
177  
178  
179  
180  
181  
182  
183  
184  
185  
186  
187  
188  
189  
190  
191  
192  
193  
194  
195  
196  
197  
198  
199  
200  
201  
202  
203  
204  
205  
206  
207  
208  
209  
210  
211  
212  
213  
214  
215  
216  
217  
218  
219  
220  
221  
222  
223  
224  
225  
226  
227  
228  
229  
230  
231  
232  
233  
234  
235  
236  
237  
238  
239  
240  
241  
242  
243  
244  
245  
246  
247  
248  
249  
250  
251  
252  
253  
254  
255  
256  
257  
258  
259  
260  
261  
262  
263  
264  
265  
266  
267  
268  
269  
270  
271  
272  
273  
274  
275  
276  
277  
278  
279  
280  
281  
282  
283  
284  
285  
286  
287  
288  
289  
290  
291  
292  
293  
294  
295  
296  
297  
298  
299  
300  
301  
302  
303  
304  
305  
306  
307  
308  
309  
310  
311  
312  
313  
314  
315  
316  
317  
318  
319  
320  
321  
322  
323  
324  
325  
326  
327  
328  
329  
330  
331  
332  
333  
334  
335  
336  
337  
338  
339  
340  
341  
342  
343  
344  
345  
346  
347  
348  
349  
350  
351  
352  
353  
354  
355  
356  
357  
358  
359  
360  
361  
362  
363  
364  
365  
366  
367  
368  
369  
370  
371  
372  
373  
374  
375  
376  
377  
378  
379  
380  
381  
382  
383  
384  
385  
386  
387  
388  
389  
390  
391  
392  
393  
394  
395  
396  
397  
398  
399  
400  
401  
402  
403  
404  
405  
406  
407  
408  
409  
410  
411  
412  
413  
414  
415  
416  
417  
418  
419  
420  
421  
422  
423  
424  
425  
426  
427  
428  
429  
430  
431  
432  
433  
434  
435  
436  
437  
438  
439  
440  
441  
442  
443  
444  
445  
446  
447  
448  
449  
450  
451  
452  
453  
454  
455  
456  
457  
458  
459  
460  
461  
462  
463  
464  
465  
466  
467  
468  
469  
470  
471  
472  
473  
474  
475  
476  
477  
478  
479  
480  
481  
482  
483  
484  
485  
486  
487  
488  
489  
490  
491  
492  
493  
494  
495  
496  
497  
498  
499  
500  
501  
502  
503  
504  
505  
506  
507  
508  
509  
510  
511  
512  
513  
514  
515  
516  
517  
518  
519  
520  
521  
522  
523  
524  
525  
526  
527  
528  
529  
530  
531  
532  
533  
534  
535  
536  
537  
538  
539  
540  
541  
542  
543  
544  
545  
546  
547  
548  
549  
550  
551  
552  
553  
554  
555  
556  
557  
558  
559  
560  
561  
562  
563  
564  
565  
566  
567  
568  
569  
570  
571  
572  
573  
574  
575  
576  
577  
578  
579  
580  
581  
582  
583  
584  
585  
586  
587  
588  
589  
590  
591  
592  
593  
594  
595  
596  
597  
598  
599  
600  
601  
602  
603  
604  
605  
606  
607  
608  
609  
610  
611  
612  
613  
614  
615  
616  
617  
618  
619  
620  
621  
622  
623  
624  
625  
626  
627  
628  
629  
630  
631  
632  
633  
634  
635  
636  
637  
638  
639  
640  
641  
642  
643  
644  
645  
646  
647  
648  
649  
650  
651  
652  
653  
654  
655  
656  
657  
658  
659  
660  
661  
662  
663  
664  
665  
666  
667  
668  
669  
670  
671  
672  
673  
674  
675  
676  
677  
678  
679  
680  
681  
682  
683  
684  
685  
686  
687  
688  
689  
690  
691  
692  
693  
694  
695  
696  
697  
698  
699  
700  
701  
702  
703  
704  
705  
706  
707  
708  
709  
710  
711  
712  
713  
714  
715  
716  
717  
718  
719  
720  
721  
722  
723  
724  
725  
726  
727  
728  
729  
730  
731  
732  
733  
734  
735  
736  
737  
738  
739  
740  
741  
742  
743  
744  
745  
746  
747  
748  
749  
750  
751  
752  
753  
754  
755  
756  
757  
758  
759  
760  
761  
762  
763  
764  
765  
766  
767  
768  
769  
770  
771  
772  
773  
774  
775  
776  
777  
778  
779  
780  
781  
782  
783  
784  
785  
786  
787  
788  
789  
790  
791  
792  
793  
794  
795  
796  
797  
798  
799  
800  
801  
802  
803  
804  
805  
806  
807  
808  
809  
810  
811  
812  
813  
814  
815  
816  
817  
818  
819  
820  
821  
822  
823  
824  
825  
826  
827  
828  
829  
830  
831  
832  
833  
834  
835  
836  
837  
838  
839  
840  
841  
842  
843  
844  
845  
846  
847  
848  
849  
850  
851  
852  
853  
854  
855  
856  
857  
858  
859  
860  
861  
862  
863  
864  
865  
866  
867  
868  
869  
870  
871  
872  
873  
874  
875  
876  
877  
878  
879  
880  
881  
882  
883  
884  
885  
886  
887  
888  
889  
890  
891  
892  
893  
894  
895  
896  
897  
898  
899  
900  
901  
902  
903  
904  
905  
906  
907  
908  
909  
910  
911  
912  
913  
914  
915  
916  
917  
918  
919  
920  
921  
922  
923  
924  
925  
926  
927  
928  
929  
930  
931  
932  
933  
934  
935  
936  
937  
938  
939  
940  
941  
942  
943  
944  
945  
946  
947  
948  
949  
950  
951  
952  
953  
954  
955  
956  
957  
958  
959  
960  
961  
962  
963  
964  
965  
966  
967  
968  
969  
970  
971  
972  
973  
974  
975  
976  
977  
978  
979  
980  
981  
982  
983  
984  
985  
986  
987  
988  
989  
990  
991  
992  
993  
994  
995  
996  
997  
998  
999  
1000

JAMES L. ROBART

United States District Judge

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned certifies that on August 12, 2020, I caused to be served via the CM/ECF system a true and correct copy of the foregoing document and that service of this document was accomplished on all parties in the case by the CM/ECF system.

s/ Mica D. Klein

Mica D. Klein, WSBA No. 46596

MicaKlein@perkinscoie.com